



## Mixed Oxidants versus Chlorine Gas

	Mixed Oxidants	Chlorine Gas
Disinfection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Two to ten times more effective than chlorine</li> <li>• Broader inactivation range - can kill <i>Cryptosporidium</i> and <i>Giardia</i></li> <li>• More rapid disinfection</li> <li>• Lower dose required</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Effective kill on certain microorganisms</li> <li>• Higher CT value (more time and higher dose required)</li> <li>• Cannot kill <i>Cryptosporidium</i> or other resistant organisms</li> </ul>
Chlorine Residual Maintenance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• More stable throughout the entire distribution system</li> <li>• Lasts longer (maintained for at least 25 miles)</li> <li>• Up to 30% lower dosage required to maintain residual</li> <li>• Can eliminate the need for ammonia or booster stations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can vary widely throughout system</li> <li>• Must often be boosted or combined with ammonia to last throughout distribution system</li> <li>• A higher dosage is required to maintain equal residual</li> </ul>
DBPs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reduces THM formation by <math>\frac{1}{2}</math> to <math>\frac{1}{5}</math> as compared to chlorine</li> <li>• Chlorates and bromates are well below MCLs</li> <li>• Does not produce chlorites</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• More likely to exceed MCL for TTHMs in highly organic surface waters</li> </ul>
Regulations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No DOT rules</li> <li>• No RMP or PSM planning</li> <li>• No safety equipment or training</li> <li>• Complies with Uniform Fire Code</li> <li>• Meets all EPA water regulations</li> <li>• Studies at the University of North Carolina/CDC demonstrate compliance with the Enhanced SWTR for <i>Crypto</i> inactivation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Transportation of gas cylinders must comply with DOT regulations</li> <li>• Requires RMP or PSM planning for large quantities stored on-site</li> <li>• Requires specialized breathing apparatus, "buddy" rule for changing cylinders, and periodic HAZMAT training</li> <li>• Cannot meet Enhanced SWTR for <i>Cryptosporidium</i> inactivation</li> </ul>
Safety	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Uses only salt water and 9 to 12 VDC electricity</li> <li>• Reduces liability exposure</li> <li>• No safety training or special equipment for workers</li> <li>• Operator and community safety</li> <li>• Avoids equipment corrosion</li> <li>• Hydrogen gas from electrolysis is safely vented from the system</li> <li>• Safer water – fewer DBPs and microorganisms than chlorine</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Gas under pressure creates potential for explosion or fire</li> <li>• Potential for poisonous gas leaks</li> <li>• Potential for chlorine burns</li> <li>• Dangerous for both the operator and the surrounding community</li> <li>• Liability exposure</li> <li>• Safety equipment and safety training is necessary</li> <li>• Creates a corrosion problem</li> </ul>



	Mixed Oxidants	Chlorine Gas
Taste & Odor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Excellent taste – reactions with ammonia and phenols do not result in chemical taste or odor</li> <li>• Algacidal properties eliminate taste and odor caused by algae</li> <li>• Does not form di- or trichloramines when used for breakpoint chlorination</li> <li>• Oxidizes H<sub>2</sub>S</li> <li>• No chlorine taste even at relatively high doses</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Often imparts a chlorine taste and odor, especially when combined with ammonia</li> <li>• Cannot eliminate H<sub>2</sub>S taste or odor problems</li> </ul>
Ease of Use	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fully automated unit requires minimal training and operator attention</li> <li>• Cell replaced roughly every 5 years – takes only 10 minutes</li> <li>• Oxidant used as produced so there is no deterioration</li> <li>• No ionic membranes, gas exchange venturis, or complex changing and cleaning process</li> <li>• Safety gear is unnecessary</li> <li>• During initial startup, water system may have to be flushed as mixed oxidants clean out biofilms in distribution piping</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Regular change-out of cylinders requires complicated safety training and gear</li> <li>• Requires periodic cleaning and change-out of gas venturi injection system</li> <li>• May be necessary to scrape off corrosion</li> </ul>
Pretreatment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Acts like ozone in regard to enhanced microfloculation</li> <li>• Reduces coagulant consumption by up to 40%</li> <li>• Can cut corresponding fluoride dose requirements</li> <li>• Significantly reduces clarifier settling times</li> <li>• Reduces turbidity</li> <li>• Improves filter runs</li> <li>• Maximizes plant flow</li> <li>• Decreases sludge handling</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Can be used for pretreatment but typically results in high TTHMs</li> </ul>
Iron & Manganese	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Effective at oxidizing iron and manganese</li> <li>• May eliminate use of KMnO<sub>4</sub></li> <li>• A lower dosage and contact time achieves removal</li> <li>• Precipitate must be filtered out or settled before removal</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Is less effective at oxidizing iron and manganese</li> </ul>
Cost Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Higher capital cost is usually offset by lower operating cost, resulting in a lower lifecycle cost</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lower installation cost when gas scrubber is not considered, but higher lifecycle cost</li> </ul>

